REPUBLIC OF VANUATU OFFICE OF THE OMBUDSMAN

PUBLIC REPORT

ON THE

MISUSE OF MP ALLOCATION FUND BY FORMER MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT FOR BANKS & TORRES, MR. STANLEY REGINALD

8 April 2003

1183/2003/05

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SU	IMMARY	3
1.	JURISDICTION	4
2.	PURPOSE, SCOPE OF INVESTIGATION AND METHODS USED	4
3.	RELEVANT LAWS, REGULATIONS AND RULES	4
4.	OUTLINE OF EVENTS	4
5.	RESPONSES BY THOSE WITH FINDINGS AGAINST THEM	5
6.	FINDINGS	5
7.	RECOMMENDATIONS	6
8.	INDEX OF APPENDICES	7

PUBLIC REPORT ON THE MISUSE OF MP ALLOCATION FUND BY FORMER MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT FOR BANKS & TORRES, MR. STANLEY REGINALD

SUMMARY

This report covers findings made by the Ombudsman in his investigation into the former Member of Parliament, Mr. Stanley Reginald (Mr. Reginald). Mr. Reginald, in his term as Member of Parliament for Banks and Torres constituency, is alleged to have misused his MP allocation fund for the years 1999 and 2000. Goods and money were requested by unknown people and were thus never received by various communities who later discovered their names in the government invoices, LPOs and GPVs.

The Ombudsman finds that Mr. Reginald violated his obligations as a leader under the Leadership Code Act by having conflicts of interest and apparently committing theft. The Ombudsman is recommending that legal proceedings be taken against Mr. Reginald for using public money for his own interest instead of the public good and that the release of allocation funds should be strictly monitored and accounted for.

JURISDICTION

1.1 The Constitution, the Ombudsman Act and the Leadership Code Act allow the Ombudsman to enquire into the conduct of government, related bodies and the Leaders. This includes the former Member of Parliament for Banks & Torres, Mr. Stanley Reginald (Mr. Reginald) who was a leader at that time of the actions discussed in this report.

2. PURPOSE, SCOPE OF INVESTIGATION AND METHODS USED

- 2.1 The purpose of this report is to present the findings of the Ombudsman as required by the Constitution, the Ombudsman Act and the Leadership Code Act.
- 2.2 The scope of this investigation is to establish the facts about the alleged misappropriation of his MP (Member of Parliament) allocation fund by former MP for Banks & Torres, Mr. Reginald. The allegations involve goods and money from the allocation fund not being received by various communities in his constituency, missing goods obtained from his allocation fund and the involvement of personal interest.
- 2.3 This investigation has been hampered by the difficulty in getting Mr. Reginald to provide the information in relation to the allegations in this report.
- 2.4 This Office collects information and documents by informal request, summons, letters, interviews and research.

3. RELEVANT LAWS, REGULATIONS AND RULES

- 3.1 Relevant parts of the following laws are reproduced in Appendix A.
- Articles 66 and 67 of the Constitution provides the definition of a leader and conduct expected from a leader.
- 3.3 Section 11 of the Ombudsman Act gives power to the Ombudsman to investigate leaders under the Leadership Code Act.
- 3.4 Sections 7, 18, 20 & 24 of the Leadership Code Act define conflict of interest, private interest and outline breaches of the Code.

OUTLINE OF EVENTS

4.1. On 18 September 1998, it is alleged that Mr. Reginald used money from his allocation in LPO 318956 (Local Purchase Order) worth vt113,000 to purchase some items for donation to Sereti village. See Appendix B: LPO 318956. From the copy of the Micro Project Application Form, the following goods were applied for; 2 cooking pots, 2 Coleman lights, 2 spades, 2 shovels, 6 rakes and 2 pinch bars; See Appendix C: Micro Project Application Form. It was claimed that the following items were received: the 2 cooking pots, 6 shovels, 6 spades and 6 rakes. The items were contrary to what was paid for. There was supposed to be only 2 shovels and 2 spades and not 6 as presented to the community of Sereti. Also the 2 pinch bars and the 2 Coleman lights were not received.

- 4.2. On 18 September 1998, it is alleged that Mr. Reginald used funds from his MP allocation in LPO 318956 in the name of Barvet village, Gaua Island to purchase 20 bags of cement worth vt26,250 for his nephew Masten Harris. See Appendix D: LPO 318956.
- 4.3. On 31 March 1999, it is alleged that Mr. Reginald used his MP allocation in the name of Letoltol community (which is the same as Sereti where he comes from) in order to obtain goods amounting to vt290,000 in LPO 328139. The money was used to purchase a 25 HP outboard motor engine. It is alleged that Mr. Reginald's brother and father are in possession of the engine. See Appendix E: LPO 328139.
- 4.4. On 9 April 1999, it is alleged that Mr. Reginald used his MP allocation from LPO 297089 to donate vt100,000 to Bigstone community, however, it is claimed that the money was not received. See **Appendix F: LPO 297089**.
- 4.5. On 11 June 1999, it is alleged that Mr. Reginald used his allocation as a donation to the people of Merig Island via GPV 298468 (Government Payment Voucher). It is claimed that the money was not seen. See Appendix F: GPV 298468.
- 4.6. On 31 March 1999, it is alleged that Mr. Reginald used his allocation fund to purchase some agricultural supplies for the community of Lembal, East Gaua. It is claimed that the goods were not received.
- 4.7. It is also alleged that for the year 2000, Mr. Reginald did not make any contribution to his constituency. For the year 2001 as well, nothing happened, except for the construction of Mr. Reginald's bungalow, his private property.

RESPONSES BY THOSE WITH FINDINGS AGAINST THEM

5.1 Before starting this enquiry, the Ombudsman notified all people or bodies complained of and gave them the right to reply. Also a working paper was provided prior to this public report to give another opportunity to respond. No response is received from people concerned.

FINDINGS

6.1. Finding 1: The Ombudsman finds that Mr. Reginald may have breached section 20 of the Leadership Code Act.

Section 20 of the Leadership Code Act states that a leader must not use or agree to use public money other than for the purpose which it may be lawfully used. An MP allocation fund is public money and is to be used for the needs of the people of Vanuatu. Failing to meet the request of people or withholding goods purchased from the allocation fund (or cash from the fund itself) is a misuse of public money. MP Reginald was found to have withheld some goods and money that was supposed to be donated to communities in his constituency.

6.2. Finding 2: The Ombudsman finds that Mr. Reginald may have breached section 24 of the Leadership Code Act.

Mr. Reginald allegedly purchased 20 bags of cement for his nephew, Mr. Masten Harris on 18 September 1998. This is regarded as a conflict of interest, in breach of section 24 of the Leadership Code Act.

In section 7(2) of the Leadership Code Act, conflict of interest is defined as a personal benefit a leader directly or indirectly obtains from a decision on an official matter. Section 24 states that if a leader has a conflict of interest on a matter, he must not act in relation to the matter in such a way that the leader or a close member of his or her close family benefits from the action.

6.3. Finding 3: The Ombudsman finds that Mr. Reginald may have breached section 20 of the Leadership Code when he applied his contribution mostly to the construction of his bungalows and not to providing any service to his constituency during year 2001.

It is alleged that Mr. Reginald was constructing his private bungalows in the year 2001 and did not make any contribution to his community.

6.4. Finding 4: The Ombudsman finds that Mr. Reginald may have committed theft.

In this allegation, the Ombudsman found that MP Reginald may have stolen the Coleman lights and the pinch bars purchased from LPO 318956, vt100,000 from GPV 297089 meant for a donation to Bigstone community, vt104,500 obtained from GPV 298468 meant for a donation to the people of Merig Island and the agricultural supplies intended to be a donation to the people of Lembal community.

RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Recommendation 1: Legal proceedings be taken by the Public Prosecutor against Mr. Stanley Reginald for the breaches of the Leadership Code Act and any other

law mentioned in this report.

7.2 Recommendation 2: The Office of the Speaker and the Finance

Department should develop a more effective system for monitoring how MP allocation funds are

used.

Dated the 8th day of April 2003.

Hannington G ALATOA

OMBUDSMAN OF THE REPUBLIC OF VANUATU

8. INDEX OF APPENDICES

- A Relevant laws.
- B Copy of LPO 318956.
- C Copy of Micro Project Application Form.
- D Second copy of LPO 318956 relating to the purchase of 20 bags of cement.
- E Copy of LPO 328139.
- F Copy of GPV 297089.
- G Copy of GPV 298468.

ANNEXURE 'A'

RELEVANT LAWS

CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF VANUATU

CONDUCT OF LEADERS

- 66.(1) Any person defined as a leader in Article 67 has a duty to conduct himself in such a way, both in his public and private life, so as not to-
 - place himself in a position in which he has or could have a conflict of interests or in which the fair exercise of his public or official duties might be compromised;
 - (b) demean his office or position;
 - (c) allow his integrity to be called into question; or
 - endanger or diminish respect for and confidence in the integrity of the Government of the Republic of Vanuatu.
 - (2) In particular, a leader shall not use his office for personal gain or enter into any transaction or engage in any enterprise or activity that might be expected to give rise to doubt in the public mind as to whether he is carrying out or has carried out the duty imposed by subarticle (1).

DEFINITION OF A LEAD ER

67. For the purposes of this Chapter, a leader means the President of the Republic, the Prime Minister and other Ministers, members of Parliament, and such public servants, officers of Government agencies and other officers as may be prescribed by law.

OMBUDSMAN ACT 27 OF 1998

FUNCTIONS OF THE OMBUDSMAN

- 11. (1) The Ombudsman has the following functions:
 - in respect of conduct of a leader occurring on or before the 1st day of July 1998, to enquire into any case of alleged or suspected breach of Chapter 10 (Leadership Code) of the Constitution;
 - (b). in respect of conduct of a leader occurring after 1st July 1998, to conduct an investigation in accordance with Part 5 of the Leadership Code Act No. 2 of 1998.

LEADERSHIP CODE ACT 2 OF 1998

PART 1 - PRELIMINARY

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

 A leader has a conflict of interest in a matter if the leader, or a member of the leader's close family, could benefit directly or indirectly from a decision on the matter, except as a member of a community or group.

PART 2 - DUTIES OF LEADERS

DIVESTING OF ASSETS

 In any case, the leader must not involve himself in the day to day management of the interest (his/her private interest)

PART 3 - BREACHES OF LEADERSHIP CODE

MISUSE OF PUBLIC MONEY

20. A leader must not use or agree to the use of, any public money for a purpose other than the purpose for which it may be lawfully be used.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

24. A leader who has a conflict of interest in relation to a matter must not act in relation to the matter, or arrange for someone else to act in relation to the matter, in such a way that the leader or a member of his or her close family benefits from the action.

GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC GOUVERNEMENT DE LA RÉPUBLIQU

APPENDIX B

TRIPLICATE: to Vote Book Controller TRIPLICATA : au responsable

du livre de comptes

LOCAL PURCHASE ORDER / ORDRE D'ACHAT LOCAL

4+RJW+RF To (Supplier) A (Fournisseur)

Please supply to the Prière de fournir au Service STAKET PEGOVOLI

F, S Account No. / No. de compte Date:

Description of goods or services Description des fournitures ou services	Quantity Quantité	Unit Price Prix unitaire	TOTAL COST / VT COUT TOTAL / VT
(ooking Pots (Large).	ス		72.000
Cenuf	\$ me	26250	705.006
1 RON (65 in 40 (12 FT) 14 (9 FT)	54/KeA		127.260
t., b. class water Lank	/	+	79.000
2 YAM SPISE	Z	2250	4500
2 SHAVEL	2	1660	3320
2 PING4 BAR	2	990	1980
2 (ciman (1607 (Large)	2	9000	18000
6 RAKKS	6	2200	13200
ocal Furchase Order proved by authorised officer. ordre d'Achat Local approuvé or l'agent habilité. Signature Print Name / Nom el IARIS		Total Cost VT Total en VT	11311260

FOR USE BY THE VOTE BOOK HOLDER RÉSZRVÉ AU RESPONSABLE DU LIVRE DE COMPTES

Date entered in Vote Book :		
Date d'inscription dans le livre de comptes :		

Vote book - Page No. : Livre de compte - Page No. :

MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT ALLOCATION

MICRO PROJECT APPLICATION FORM

N. 4 SEP. LOUR

PART I. To be filled by the applicant (please read the 31)	idelines at the end of this form)
To be filled by the sep	1. 2 Planticar.
1. Project Title: 3 Com Kinty Pots, 6 A.	ROS, NCOLGAIN TO
1. Project Title: 3 Community Applying: 3 3 8 5 7 1/L	Cice Ceccalus
2. Name of community applying: SERCIAL 19	stand: GACA
	LAFE
6 KAKES BLOCK HEKEN	tota Lose Countile
6 KARES BLOCK TO COM	-536. LAICHTCHLORGH.
CENTRE, Walnut PARCH 1316.	
CENTRE, W Col HAN LICHT ON SHAVEL & SPAP PLACE TEARS. S. Number of people directly affected 160 places	yec I
6. Bezeis:	
0. 0	RECEIVED
	8 - Alia 2001
	OMBUDSMAN

7. Breakdown of costs (including freight):

lian	Supplie	T	Cost (vt)
2.81	Saulo 1	to dres	V172 000
2 Colmon Light	100	ord mus	VI 18.000
3 Stade Van	1 12	11	4500
2 Shavel	1.		3325
6 Bake	7.		13 200
6 2 Pinsta	11		1980
7	**		
3			
		Form cost	1113,000



GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLI GOUVERNEMENT DE LA RÉPUBLIC

Please supply to the

APPENDIX D

TRIPLICATE: to Vote Book Controller TRIPLICATA : au responsable du livre de comptes

LOCAL PURCHASE ORDER / ORDRE D'ACHAT LOCAL

4+RIW+RE To (Supplier) A (Fournisseur) STAKET PEGNOS

PO BOXIUE *****424,260vatu * # Dept 02 Op ID emiliano *
Oppartment 18/09/3033 10 P02*

9. 9. Account No. / No. de compte

Prière de fournir au Service

. Description of go Description des	oods or services fournitures ou services		Quantity Quantité	Unit Price Prix unitaire	TOTAL COST / VT COUT TOTAL / VT
looking 1	tots (Large	·) .	2		72.000
Cenut		4	2000	26250	705.006
1200 Koding 40 (124	r) 1x (9r	<i>*</i> .)	54/Ke 4		127.260
tirbuclass	water-an	ck.	1	-	79 500
2 Yam SPKBE		B.	Z	2250	4500
2 SHAVEL			2	1660	3320
2 PM64 BAR			2	990	1950
2 (ciman	61647 (La	··se)	2	9000	18000
6 RAKAS			6	2200	13200
al Purchase Order roved by authorised officer. Ire d'Achat Local approuvé l'agent habilité.	3755 III	int Name / Nom en	majuscule	Total Cost VT Total en VT	11311260

FOR USE BY THE VOTE BOOK HOLDER RÉSERVÉ AU RESPONSABLE DU LIVRE DE COMPTES

Date entered in Vote Book :		
Date d'inscription dans le livre de comptes :	¥ = =	

Vote book - Page No. : Livre de compte - Page No. :

APPENDIX E GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC O GOUVERNEMENT DE LA RÉPUBLIQUE DE VANUATU

LOCAL PURCHASE ORDER / ORDRE D'ACHAT LOCAL

.RIPLICATE: to Vote Book Controller TRIPLICATA: au responsable du livre de comptes

To (Supplier) ACCO MUTURS A (Fournisseur) , MP PILGINALD TANLE Prière de fournir au Service Date 21211 Account No. / No.	Department Department Department *****	02 053 208	rvved/to * ,000vatu * emiliano * 4 tty1P08*
Description of goods or services Description des fournitures ou services	Quantity Ouantité	Unit Price Prix unitaire	TOTAL COST / VT COUT TOTAL / VT
4			ā _E
Youngha Outleand Motor SCHP		3610,000	276000
	2		
			3
Deing MP Allocation	*		
for Horn Pregnald Janley		27	
MP for Donness/Tomess			l l
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			£1
	- 7		
Local Fulchase Order	e / Nom en majuscule 11 L. 13 16-yr	Total Cost VT Total en VT	عرب الارت الارتكام

2112199

3112km

FOR USE BY THE VOTE BOOK HOLDER RÉSERVÉ AU RESPONSABLE DU LIVRE DE COMPTES

Date entered in Vote Book: Date d'inscription dans le livre de comptes :

Vote book - Page No. : Livre de compte - Page No. :

RECEIVED

8 - Alia 2001

OMBUDSMAN

29.0000

Line No. :

Ligne No. :

	APPENDIX F	RECEIVED
GENERAL PANUCOVERNA		8- WED
GENERALPAYMENTAVO	UCHER - 3	Control of the contro
7/3		** * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *
1/1-10	1,	* value *****100,000vatu *
O'ME Pigetone Vill	11111	* Nept 02 Op ID emiliano *
	1 Hanly !	* Datevouchen04/mesonnyusety1P09*
MP for LANK	TOWES "	2,9,7,0,8,9
		DEPT. DOCUMENT REFERENCE
	*	DEFT. BOCOMENT REPERENCE
d ::		
DETAILS OF PAYMA	EN T	
City Doughon to he	ali smaller Prince	
		ACCOUNT NUMBER JOB NUMBER
- Rein XIP Allo	dation	2102 ALECHA CICIZIS
		GROSS AMOUNT VT
For Hen. Beginn	d Shares	1-1 /1010/01010
100	,	THE DESCRIPTION
MP for Backs	TO men3.	LESS DEDUCTIONS VT
	1	
		NET AMOUNT VT
		LIII/bioloido
		NUMBER OF PERIODS
	1	
PAYMENT ENTERED IN VOTE BOOK		11
Votu Book Page Nº Line Nº. :		JOB CREDIT AMOUNT VT. PERIODS
Date:		IMBER CREDIT AMOUNT VI. PERIODS
CERTIFICATION BY HEAD OF DEPT. OR AUTHORISED OFFICER	. MULTIPLE	EALLOCATIONS - DEBITS
certify that the above particulars are correct: that the prices charged are fair and reasonable and are in accordance with quotation or contract: that the excenditure		MBER DEBIT AMOUNT VT PERIODS
roject specifications: that the accordance with quotation or contract: that the expenditure committed has been properly incurred against the budget lead or project indicated by the account number(s) shown and is in accordance with government regulations and project specifications: that funds are available to meet this		
ind is in accordance with government regulations and roject specifications : that funds are available to meet this ayment under the Account furmber(s) quoted.		
layment under the Account varioer(s) duoise.		
Jay Dary		
	ACCOLINTANT	SENERAL DEPARTMENT USE
ignature of Head of Department.	Checked Approved	Cheque Number Cheque Date
*		- COOC
rint Name :	Received from the Government the s	5889061 14 64.77



	2220	1795	C6 C	Pol			_
VANUATU GOVERNMEN	APPENDIX	G	E TO TR	EASURY FOR	PAYER	ADVIC	<u>.</u>
GENERAL PAYMENT VOUCH	462 1 1 11.11	* * *	** * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	Appr ***104,	oved to 500vat milian ttyl	**** to * tu * no * P13* ****	
DETAILS OF PAYMEN	i sacalaris	1 1 1	a asta	skyle II iI	lick!	111	
I TORY DANCING THE HELLING	I KAN DALL		—	*****			
How Kromad Jan Kill of Miles In Miles I	mes	E .		GROSS AMO	OUNT VI.		
	ECEIVED			1 1165	14 -10	10	Î
8	- AHR 2001 BUDSMAN	<i>i</i>	NU	MBER OF PERIODS			E
AYMENT ENTERED IN VOTE BOOK		- (DEDUCTIONS				N°
ote Book Page N°Line N°. :	ACCOUNT NUM	BER	JOB NUMBER	CREDIT	AMOUNT	VT	PERIODS
gnature:		1.1					
ate:		1-1	1 1 1			لللا	
CERTIFICATION BY HEAD OF DEPT. OR AUTHORISED OFFICER		MUL	TIPLE ALLOCA			_	Nº.
certify that the above particulars are correct : that the rices charged are fair and reasonable and are in accorrices charged are fair and reasonable and are in according to the contract : that the expenditure	ACCOUNT NU	MBER	JOB NUMBER	DEBIT	THUOMA	VT	PERIOOS
ommitted has been properly incurred against the budget					1-	11	H
nead or project indicates with government regulations and and is in accoordance with government regulations and the strange are available to meet this		1.1.			14	_1_1_	
project specifications: that full do all divided by ayment under the Account Number(s) quoted.		1.1	1 1 1		$\perp \perp$	لل	
- Van XVIII		1 1	111				
		ACCOUNT	ANT GENERA	L DEPARTME	NT USE	N.	
Signature of Head of Department	Checked	-	bevor	Cheque Nur	nber		e Date
Official Stamp.	N			5091-	32	18/0	619,
Print Name:	Received from the Signed:		nt the sum of V	11			* _ K